

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE**

STATE OF DELAWARE, *ex rel.*  
KATHLEEN JENNINGS, Attorney General of  
the State of Delaware,

Plaintiff,

v.

BP AMERICA INC., BP P.L.C., CHEVRON  
CORPORATION,  
CHEVRON U.S.A. INC., CONOCOPHILLIPS,  
CONOCOPHILLIPS COMPANY, PHILLIPS  
66, PHILLIPS 66 COMPANY, EXXON  
MOBIL CORPORATION, EXXONMOBIL  
OIL CORPORATION, XTO ENERGY INC.,  
HESS CORPORATION, MARATHON OIL  
CORPORATION, MARATHON OIL  
COMPANY, MARATHON PETROLEUM  
CORPORATION, MARATHON  
PETROLEUM COMPANY LP, SPEEDWAY  
LLC, MURPHY OIL CORPORATION,  
MURPHY USA INC.,  
ROYAL DUTCH SHELL PLC, SHELL OIL  
COMPANY, CITGO PETROLEUM  
CORPORATION, TOTAL S.A., TOTAL  
SPECIALTIES USA INC., OCCIDENTAL  
PETROLEUM CORPORATION, DEVON  
ENERGY CORPORATION, APACHE  
CORPORATION, CNX RESOURCES  
CORPORATION, CONSOL ENERGY INC.,  
OVINTIV, INC., and AMERICAN  
PETROLEUM INSTITUTE,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 20-cv-01429-LPS

**DEFENDANTS' NOTICE OF SUPPLEMENTAL AUTHORITY**

Defendants write to inform the Court of the Second Circuit’s decision in *City of New York v. Chevron Corp., et al.*, \_\_\_ F.3d \_\_\_, 2021 WL 1216541 (2d Cir. Apr. 1, 2021), which affirmed the dismissal of an action that, like this one, sought to hold energy producers liable for climate change-related harms under state tort law.<sup>1</sup> In doing so, the Second Circuit specifically held that the plaintiff engaged in “artful pleading” by attempting to “transform the City’s Complaint into anything other than a suit over global greenhouse gas emissions.” *Id.* at \*5. That decision is relevant to this case for at least three reasons.

*First*, *City of New York* supports Defendants’ argument that this case was properly removed under the Court’s federal-question jurisdiction because the court found that “Plaintiff’s claims necessarily arise under federal, not state, law, because they seek to regulate transboundary and international emissions and pollution.” Dkt. 96 at 16. As the Second Circuit explained, “[g]lobal warming presents a uniquely international problem of national concern [and] is therefore not well-suited to the application of state law,” *City of New York*, 2021 WL 1216541, at \*6, and as a result, claims seeking damages for the alleged impacts of global climate change “must be brought under federal common law,” *id.* at \*9. And while Plaintiff insists that federal-question jurisdiction does not exist over this action because, “[u]nder the cardinal ‘well-pleaded complaint rule,’ ‘federal jurisdiction exists only when a federal question is presented on the face of the plaintiff’s properly pleaded complaint,’” Dkt. 89 at 7, *City of New York* held that the plaintiff’s claims were necessarily governed by federal common law despite being pleaded under state law, expressly rejecting the plaintiff’s effort to disguise “those federal claims” as state-law claims, *City of New York*, 2021 WL

---

<sup>1</sup> This Notice of Supplemental Authority is submitted subject to, and without waiver of, any defense, affirmative defense, or objection, including personal jurisdiction, insufficient process, or insufficient service of process.

1216541, at \*9.; *see also id.* at \*5 (“Artful pleading cannot transform the City’s complaint into anything other than a suit over global greenhouse gas emissions.”).<sup>2</sup>

The Second Circuit also agreed with Defendants that, insofar as the Clean Air Act displaces federal common law in this action, this displacement does not resuscitate Plaintiff’s purported state-law claims. *Cf.* Dkt. 89 at 11 (“Defendants’ federal common law theory fails because the [Clean Air Act] displaced whatever federal common law might once have related to greenhouse gas emissions.”) In particular, the Second Circuit followed the two-step framework advocated by Defendants here by first evaluating whether federal or state law governed the plaintiff’s claims (answer: federal), and only then considering whether the plaintiff had a valid claim under that law (answer: no). *See City of New York*, 2021 WL 1216541, at \*5–12. And while the plaintiff in *City of New York* filed its complaint in federal court, such that the case did not present the same removal question at issue here, *see id.* at \*8, the Second Circuit’s rationale in disposing of the plaintiff’s claims *on the merits* on the ground that they necessarily arise under federal law clearly supports Defendants’ argument on removal.

*Second*, *City of New York* supports Defendants’ argument that federal jurisdiction exists under the federal officer removal statute, the Outer Continental Shelf Lands Act, and federal enclave jurisdiction. In opposing removal on these grounds, Plaintiff in this case—like the plaintiff

---

<sup>2</sup> When a claim “arise[s] under federal common law,” there “is a permissible basis for jurisdiction based on a federal question.” *Treiber & Straub, Inc. v. U.P.S., Inc.*, 474 F.3d 379, 383 (7th Cir. 2007). For this reason, any attempt to distinguish *City of New York* on the ground that it addressed a dismissal on the merits, whereas here the question before the Court is the propriety of removal, must fail. Although the Second Circuit specifically reserved the issue of removal, its logic compels federal jurisdiction in this case. That is because once the Court concludes that Plaintiff’s claims “must be brought under federal common law,” *City of New York*, 2021 WL 1216541, at \*9, it necessarily follows that there “is a permissible basis for jurisdiction based on a federal question,” *Treiber & Straub*, 474 F.3d at 383; *see also City of Milwaukee v. Illinois*, 451 U.S. 304, 313 n.7 (1981) (“[I]f federal common law exists, it is because state law cannot be used.”).

in *City of New York*—tries to recast its claims as going only to Defendants’ *marketing* of fossil-fuel products, rather than the production, sale, and combustion of those products. *See id.* at \*13. In particular, it contends that removal is improper because Defendants did not engage in any marketing under the direction or control of federal officers, *see* Dkt. 89 at 28–32, or in marketing on the Outer Continental Shelf or federal enclaves, *see id.* at 50–51, 56. But as the Second Circuit explained, “emissions [are] the singular source of the City’s harm,” and “[g]reenhouse gases once emitted become well mixed in the atmosphere,” at which point they “cannot be traced back to their source.” *City of New York*, 2021 WL 1216541, at \*5–6. As a result, the Second Circuit held that the plaintiff’s claims were inseparable from activities occurring worldwide: “In other words, the City requests damages for the cumulative impact of conduct occurring simultaneously across just about every jurisdiction on the planet.” *Id.* at \*6. Although the plaintiff in *City of New York*, like Plaintiff here, tried to focus on a different “link in ‘the causal chain’ of the City’s damages,” *id.* at \*5, the Second Circuit squarely rejected this as “[a]rtful pleading,” *id.* at \*5; *see also id.* at \*11 (“[T]he City’s focus on this ‘earlier moment’ in the global warming lifecycle is merely artful pleading and does not change the substance of its claims.”).

Moreover, claims like Plaintiff’s here will necessarily impact the worldwide production of fossil fuels. As the Second Circuit explained, “while the City is not expressly seeking to impose a standard of care or emission restrictions on the Producers, the goal of its lawsuit is perhaps even more ambitious: to effectively impose strict liability for the damages caused by fossil fuel emissions no matter where in the world those emissions were released (or who released them).” *Id.* at \*7. This necessarily includes, among other things, the production of fossil fuels from the Outer Continental Shelf and under the direction, supervision, and control of federal officers—and, as *City of New York* confirms, necessarily “threatens to impair the total recovery of the federally-

owned minerals” on the Outer Continental Shelf. Dkt. 96 at 32 (quoting *EP Operating Ltd. v. Placid Oil Co.*, 26 F.3d 563, 570 (5th Cir. 1994)). After all, “[i]f the Producers want to avoid all liability, then their only solution would be to cease global production altogether.” *City of New York*, 2021 WL 1216541, at \*7.

Because Plaintiff’s claims involve the production, sale, and combustion of fossil fuels—which occurred under the direction, supervision, and control of federal officers, and which occurred on the Outer Continental Shelf and federal enclaves—Plaintiff’s motion to remand should be denied.

*Third*, *City of New York* supports Defendants’ argument that federal jurisdiction exists under *Grable & Sons Metal Products, Inc. v. Darue Engineering & Manufacturing*, 545 U.S. 308 (2005) because Plaintiff’s claims here, like those asserted in *New York*, “attempt to supplant federal energy policy, exercise the federal foreign affairs power, and regulate Defendants’ speech over matters of public concern.” Dkt. 96 at 22. As the Second Circuit recognized, “greenhouse gas emissions are the subject of numerous federal statutory regimes and international treaties” that “provide interlocking frameworks for regulating greenhouse gas emissions, as well as enforcement mechanisms to ensure that those regulations are followed.” *City of New York*, 2021 WL 1216541, at \*1; *id.* at \*6 (finding that these claims “implicat[e][ ] . . . our relations with foreign nations”). Plaintiff “has sidestepped those procedures and instead instituted a state-law tort suit . . . to recover damages caused by those companies’ admittedly legal commercial conduct in producing and selling fossil fuels around the world.” *Id.* But “in so doing, [Plaintiff] effectively seeks to replace these carefully crafted frameworks—which are the product of the political process—with a patchwork of claims under state nuisance law.” *Id.* The Second Circuit emphatically rejected this position, holding that it could not “condone such an action.” *Id.*

Respectfully submitted,

Dated: April 13, 2021

By: /s/ David E. Wilks  
David E. Wilks

K&L GATES LLP  
/s/ Steven L. Caponi  
Steven L. Caponi (No. 3484)  
Matthew B. Goeller (No. 6283)  
600 N. King Street, Suite 901  
Wilmington, DE 19801  
Phone: (302) 416-7000  
steven.caponi@klgates.com  
matthew.goeller@klgates.com

KELLOGG, HANSEN, TODD,  
FIGEL & FREDERICK, P.L.L.C.  
David C. Frederick, *pro hac vice*  
Grace W. Knofczynski, *pro hac vice*  
Daniel S. Severson, *pro hac vice*  
1615 M Street, N.W., Suite 400  
Washington, D.C. 20036  
Phone: (202) 326-7900  
dfrederick@kellogghansen.com  
gknofczynski@kellogghansen.com  
dseverson@kellogghansen.com

*Counsel for Defendants Royal Dutch Shell  
plc and Shell Oil Company*

ASHBY & GEDDES  
/s/ Catherine A. Gaul  
Catherine A. Gaul (#4310)  
500 Delaware Avenue, 8th Floor  
P.O. Box 1150  
Wilmington, Delaware 19801  
(302) 654-1888  
cgaul@ashbygeddes.com

ARNOLD & PORTER KAYE  
SCHOLER LLP  
Nancy G. Milburn, *pro hac vice*  
Diana E. Reiter, *pro hac vice*  
250 West 55th Street  
New York, NY 10019-9710  
Tel: (212) 836-8383  
Fax: (212) 836-8689  
nancy.milburn@arnoldporter.com  
diana.reiter@arnoldporter.com

Jonathan W. Hughes, *pro hac vice*  
3 Embarcadero Center, 10th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94111-4024

WILKS LAW, LLC  
David E. Wilks  
dwilks@wilks.law  
4250 Lancaster Pike, Suite 200  
Wilmington, DE 19805  
Telephone: 302.225.0858

GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP  
Theodore J. Boutrous, Jr., *pro hac vice*  
William E. Thomson, *pro hac vice*  
333 South Grand Avenue  
Los Angeles, CA 90071  
Telephone: 213.229.7000  
Facsimile: 213.229.7520  
tboutrous@gibsondunn.com  
wthomson@gibsondunn.com

Andrea E. Neuman, *pro hac vice*  
aneuman@gibsondunn.com  
200 Park Avenue  
New York, NY 10166  
Telephone: 212.351.4000  
Facsimile: 212.351.4035

Thomas G. Hungar, *pro hac vice*  
thungar@gibsondunn.com  
1050 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.,  
Washington, DC 20036  
Telephone: 202.955.8500  
Facsimile: 202.467.0539

Joshua D. Dick, *pro hac vice*  
jdick@gibsondunn.com  
555 Mission Street  
San Francisco, CA 94105-0921  
Telephone: 415.393.8200  
Facsimile: 415.393.8306

*Attorneys for Defendants  
Chevron Corporation and Chevron U.S.A. Inc.*

MORRIS NICHOLS ARSHT & TUNNELL  
/s/ Kenneth J. Nachbar  
Kenneth J. Nachbar (#2067)  
Alexandra M. Cumings (#6146)  
1201 North Market Street, 16th Floor  
P.O. Box 1347

Tel: (415) 471-3156  
Fax: (415) 471-3400  
jonathan.hughes@arnoldporter.com

Matthew T. Heartney, *pro hac vice*  
John D. Lombardo, *pro hac vice*  
777 South Figueroa Street, 44th Floor  
Los Angeles, California 90017-5844  
Tel: (213) 243-4000  
Fax: (213) 243-4199  
matthew.heartney@arnoldporter.com  
john.lombardo@arnoldporter.com

*Attorneys for Defendants BP America Inc. and  
BP p.l.c.*

RICHARDS, LAYTON & FINGER, P.A.  
/s/ Jeffrey L. Moyer  
Jeffrey L. Moyer (#3309)  
Christine D. Haynes (#4697)  
One Rodney Square  
920 North King Street  
Wilmington, DE 19801  
(302) 651-7700  
moyer@rlf.com  
haynes@rlf.com

CRAVATH, SWAINE & MOORE LLP  
Kevin Orsini, *pro hac vice*  
Vanessa A. Lavelly, *pro hac vice*  
825 Eighth Avenue  
New York, NY 10019  
Tel: (212) 474-1718  
Fax: (212) 474-3700  
E-mail: korsini@cravath.com  
E-mail: vlavelly@cravath.com

*Attorneys for Defendant Occidental  
Petroleum Corporation*

MARON MARVEL BRADLEY  
ANDERSON & TARDY LLC  
/s/ Antoinette D. Hubbard  
Antoinette D. Hubbard (No. 2308)  
Stephanie A. Fox (No. 3165)  
1201 N. Market Street, Suite 900  
P.O. Box 288  
Wilmington, DE 19801  
Tel: (302) 425-5177

Wilmington, DE 19899-1347  
Tel.: (302) 658-9200  
Fax: (302) 422-3013  
knachbar@mnat.com  
acummings@mnat.com

EIMER STAHL LLP  
Nathan P. Eimer, *pro hac vice*  
Pamela R. Hanebutt, *pro hac vice*  
Lisa S. Meyer, *pro hac vice*  
224 South Michigan Avenue, Suite 1100  
Chicago, IL 60604  
Tel: (312) 660-7600  
neimer@eimerstahl.com  
phanebutt@eimerstahl.com  
lmeyer@eimerstahl.com

Robert E. Dunn, *pro hac vice*  
99 S. Almaden Blvd. Suite 662  
San Jose, CA 95113  
Tel: (669) 231-8755  
rdunn@eimerstahl.com

*Attorneys for Defendant CITGO Petroleum  
Corporation.*

ECKERT SEAMANS CHERIN &  
MELLOTT, LLC  
/s/ Colleen D. Shields  
Colleen D. Shields, Esq. (I.D. No. 3138)  
Patrick M. Brannigan, Esq. (I.D. No. 4778)  
222 Delaware Avenue, 7th Floor  
Wilmington, DE 19801  
Telephone: (302) 574-7400  
Fax: (302) 574-7401  
Email: cshields@eckertseamans.com  
Email: arogin@eckertseamans.com

SHOOK, HARDY & BACON L.L.P.  
Tristan L. Duncan, *pro hac vice*  
Daniel B. Rogers, *pro hac vice*  
William F. Northrip, *pro hac vice*  
2555 Grand Blvd.  
Kansas City, MO 64108  
Phone: (816) 474-6550  
Email: tlduncan@shb.com  
Email: drogers@shb.com  
Email: wnorthrip@shb.com

*Attorneys for Defendant Murphy USA Inc.*

Adh@maronmarvel.com  
Saf@maronmarvel.com

HUNTON ANDREWS KURTH LLP  
Shannon S. Broome (*pro hac vice*)  
Ann Marie Mortimer (*pro hac vice*)  
50 California Street  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Tel: (415) 975-3718  
SBroome@HuntonAK.com  
AMortimer@HuntonAK.com

Shawn Patrick Regan (*pro hac vice*)  
200 Park Avenue  
New York, NY 10166  
Tel: (212) 309-1046  
SRegan@HuntonAK.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Marathon  
Petroleum Corporation, Marathon  
Petroleum Company LP, and Speedway  
LLC*

WHITE AND WILLIAMS LLP  
/s/ Christian J. Singewald  
CHRISTIAN J. SINGEWALD (#3542)  
600 N. King Street  
Suite 800  
Wilmington, DE 19801  
(302) 654-0424

MCGUIREWOODS LLP  
Joy C. Fuhr  
Brian D. Schmalzbach  
W. Cole Geddy  
800 East Canal Street  
Richmond, VA 23219  
Telephone: (804) 775-1000  
Email: jfuhr@mcguirewoods.com  
Email: bschmalzbach@mcguirewoods.com  
Email: cgeddy@mcguirewoods.com

*Attorneys for Defendant Devon Energy  
Corporation*

WOMBLE BOND DICKINSON (US) LLP  
/s/ Kevin J. Mangan  
Kevin J. Mangan (DE No. 3810)  
Kristen H. Cramer (DE No. 4512)  
Nicholas T. Verna (DE No. 6082)  
1313 North Market Street, Suite 1200  
Wilmington, Delaware 19801  
Telephone: (302) 252-4320  
Facsimile: (302) 252-4330  
Email: kevin.mangan@wbd-us.com  
Email: kristen.cramer@wbd-us.com  
Email: nick.verna@wbd-us.com

MCGUIREWOODS LLP  
Andrew G. McBride *pro hac vice*  
2001 K Street N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Telephone: (202) 857-1700  
Email: amcbride@mcguirewoods.com

*Attorneys for American Petroleum Institute*

DUANE MORRIS LLP  
/s/ Mackenzie M. Wrobel  
Mackenzie M. Wrobel (#6088)  
222 Delaware Avenue, Suite 1600  
Wilmington, DE 19801-1659  
Telephone: (302) 657-4900  
E-mail: MMWrobel@duanemorris.com

SHOOK HARDY & BACON LLP  
Michael F. Healy, *pro hac vice*  
One Montgomery St., Suite 2600  
San Francisco, CA 94104  
Telephone: (415) 544-1942  
E-mail: mfhealy@shb.com

DUANE MORRIS LLP  
Michael L. Fox, *pro hac vice*  
Spear Tower  
One Market Plaza, Suite 2200  
San Francisco, CA 94105-1127  
Telephone: (415) 957-3092  
E-mail: MLFox@duanemorris.com

*Attorneys for Defendant  
OVINTIV INC.*

MCCARTER & ENGLISH LLP  
/s/ Daniel J. Brown  
Michael P. Kelly (#2295)

CHIPMAN BROWN CICERO & COLE,  
LLP

/s/ Paul D. Brown

Paul D. Brown (#3903)  
Hercules Plaza  
1313 N. Market Street, Suite 5400  
Wilmington, DE 19801  
Tel.: (302) 295-0194  
brown@ChipmanBrown.com

Daniel J. Brown (#4688)  
Alexandra M. Joyce (#6423)  
Renaissance Centre  
405 N. King St., 8th Floor  
Wilmington, DE 19801  
(302) 984-6331  
mkelly@mccarter.com  
djbrown@mccarter.com  
ajoyce@mccarter.com

CROWELL & MORING LLP

Kathleen Taylor Sooy, *pro hac vice*  
Tracy A. Roman, *pro hac vice*  
1001 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel.: (202) 624-2500  
ksooy@crowell.com  
troman@crowell.com

LATHAM & WATKINS LLP

Steven M. Bauer, *pro hac vice*  
Margaret A. Tough, *pro hac vice*  
505 Montgomery Street, Suite 2000  
San Francisco, California 94111-6538  
(415) 391-0600  
steven.bauer@lw.com  
margaret.tough@lw.com

Honor R. Costello, *pro hac vice*

590 Madison Avenue, 20th Fl.  
New York, NY 10022  
Tel.: (212) 223-4000  
hcostello@crowell.com

BARTLIT BECK LLP

Sean C. Grimsley, *pro hac vice*  
Jameson R. Jones, *pro hac vice*  
Daniel R. Brody, *pro hac vice*  
1801 Wewatta Street, Suite 1200  
Denver, CO 80202  
(303) 592-3123  
sean.grimsley@bartlit-beck.com  
jameson.jones@bartlit-beck.com  
dan.brody@bartlit-beck.com

*Attorneys for Defendants CNX Resources  
Corp. and CONSOL Energy Inc.*

*Attorneys for Defendants ConocoPhillips and  
ConocoPhillips Company*

PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON &  
GARRISON LLP

/s/ Matthew D. Stachel

Daniel A. Mason (#5206)  
Matthew D. Stachel (#5419)  
500 Delaware Avenue, Suite 200  
Post Office Box 32  
Wilmington, DE 19899-0032  
Tel.: (302) 655-4410  
Fax: (302) 655-4420  
dmason@paulweiss.com  
mstachel@paulweiss.com

MCCARTER & ENGLISH LLP

/s/ Daniel J. Brown

Michael P. Kelly (#2295)  
Daniel J. Brown (#4688)  
Alexandra M. Joyce (#6423)  
Renaissance Centre  
405 N. King St., 8th Floor  
Wilmington, DE 19801  
(302) 984-6331  
mkelly@mccarter.com  
djbrown@mccarter.com  
ajoyce@mccarter.com

Theodore V. Wells, Jr., *pro hac vice*

Daniel J. Toal, *pro hac vice*  
Yahonnes Cleary, *pro hac vice*  
Caitlin E. Grusauskas, *pro hac vice*  
1285 Avenue of the Americas  
New York, NY 10019-6064  
Tel.: (212) 373-3000  
Fax: (212) 757-3990  
twells@paulweiss.com

LATHAM & WATKINS LLP

Steven M. Bauer, *pro hac vice*  
Margaret A. Tough, *pro hac vice*  
505 Montgomery Street, Suite 2000  
San Francisco, California 94111-6538  
(415) 391-0600

dtoal@paulweiss.com  
ycleary@paulweiss.com  
cgrusauskas@paulweiss.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Exxon Mobil Corporation, ExxonMobil Oil Corporation, and XTO Energy Inc.*

RICHARDS LAYTON & FINGER, P.A.

/s/ Robert W. Whetzel  
Robert W. Whetzel (#2288)  
Tel: (302) 651-7634  
Fax: (302) 651-7701  
One Rodney Square  
902 North King Street  
Wilmington, DE 19801  
whetzel@rlf.com

VINSON & ELKINS L.L.P.

Patrick W. Mizell, *pro hac vice*  
Matthew R. Stamm, *pro hac vice*  
Stephanie L. Noble, *pro hac vice*  
Brooke A. Noble, *pro hac vice*  
1001 Fannin Street, Suite 2500  
Houston, Texas 77002  
Tel: (713) 758-2932  
Fax: (713) 615-9935  
pmizell@velaw.com  
mstammel@velaw.com  
snoble@velaw.com  
bnoble@velaw.com

Mortimer H. Hartwell, *pro hac vice*  
555 Mission Street, Suite 2000  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
Tel: (415) 979-6930  
Fax: (415) 807-3358  
mhartwell@velaw.com

*Attorneys for Apache Corporation*

WHITE AND WILLIAMS LLP

/s/ Joseph J. Bellew  
Joseph J. Bellew (#4816)  
600 N. King Street, Suite 800  
Wilmington, DE 19801-3722  
Telephone: (302) 467-4532  
Facsimile: (302) 467-4540  
Email: bellewj@whiteandwilliams.com

BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.

steven.bauer@lw.com  
margaret.tough@lw.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Phillips 66 and Phillips 66 Company*

ABRAMS & BAYLISS LLP

/s/ Michael A. Barlow  
Michael A. Barlow (#3928)  
20 Montchanin Road, Suite 200  
Wilmington, Delaware 19807  
(302) 778-1000  
barlow@abramsbayliss.com

ORRICK, HERRINGTON & SUTCLIFFE LLP

Robert P. Reznick, *pro hac vice*  
1152 15th Street NW  
Washington, DC 20005  
(202) 339-8600  
rreznick@orrick.com

James Stengel, *pro hac vice*  
Marc R. Shapiro, *pro hac vice*  
51 West 52nd Street  
New York, New York 10019-6142  
(212) 506-5000  
jstengel@orrick.com

Catherine Y. Lui, *pro hac vice*  
405 Howard Street  
San Francisco, California 94105-2669  
(415) 773-5571  
clui@orrick.com

*Attorneys for Marathon Oil Corporation*

RICHARDS, LAYTON & FINGER, P.A.

/s/ Robert W. Whetzel  
Robert W. Whetzel (#2288)  
Blake Rohrbacher (#4750)  
One Rodney Square  
920 N. King Street  
Wilmington, DE 19801  
302-651-7700  
whetzel@rlf.com

KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP

Anna Rotman, P.C., *pro hac vice*  
609 Main Street  
Suite 4500

J. Scott Janoe, *pro hac vice*  
910 Louisiana Street, Suite 3200  
Houston, Texas 77002-4995  
Telephone: (713) 229-1553  
Facsimile: (713) 229-7953  
Email: scott.janoe@bakerbotts.com

Houston, TX 77002  
713-836-3750  
anna.rotman@kirkland.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Total S.A. and Total  
Specialties USA Inc.*

Megan Berge, *pro hac vice*  
700 K Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20001-5692  
Telephone: (202) 639-1308  
Facsimile: (202) 639-1171  
Email: megan.berge@bakerbotts.com

*Attorneys for Defendant HESS  
CORPORATION*

WHITE AND WILLIAMS LLP

*/s/ Joseph J. Bellew*

---

Joseph J. Bellew (#4816)  
600 N. King Street, Suite 800  
Wilmington, DE 19801-3722  
Telephone: (302) 467-4532  
Facsimile: (302) 467-4540  
Email: bellewj@whiteandwilliams.com

BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.

J. Scott Janoe, *pro hac vice*  
910 Louisiana Street, Suite 3200  
Houston, Texas 77002-4995  
Telephone: (713) 229-1553  
Facsimile: (713) 229-7953  
Email: scott.janoe@bakerbotts.com

Megan Berge, *pro hac vice*  
700 K Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20001-5692  
Telephone: (202) 639-1308  
Facsimile: (202) 639-1171  
Email: megan.berge@bakerbotts.com

*Attorneys for Defendant MURPHY OIL  
CORPORATION*