

1 Bradley A. Benbrook (SBN 177786)
Benbrook Law Group
2 400 Capitol Mall, Ste 2530
Sacramento, CA 95814
3 Tel: (916) 447-4900
Fax: (916) 447-4904
4 Email: brad@benbrooklawgroup.com
Counsel for Intervening States

5 PATRICK MORRISEY
West Virginia Attorney General
6 Lindsay S. See
Solicitor General
7 Thomas T. Lampman
Assistant Solicitor General
8 West Virginia Office of the Attorney General
9 1900 Kanawha Blvd. East
Building 1, Room E-26
10 Tel: (304) 558-2021
Fax: (304) 558-0140
11 Email: lindsay.s.see@wvago.gov
Counsel for Intervenor State of West Virginia

CHRISTOPHER M. CARR
Attorney General of Georgia
Andrew A. Pinson
Solicitor General
Drew F. Waldbeser
Assistant Solicitor General
Office of the Georgia Attorney General
40 Capitol Square, S.W.
Atlanta, Georgia 30334
Tel: (404) 458-3409
Fax: (404) 656-2199
Email: apinson@law.ga.gov
Counsel for Intervenor State of Georgia
(Add'l Counsel Listed on Signature Page)

13 **IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
14 **FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

15 State of California, *et al.*,
Plaintiffs,
16 v.
17 Michael Regan, *et al.*,
Defendants.

Case No. 3:20-cv-3005-RS
**STATE INTERVENORS’
OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANTS’
MOTION TO CONTINUE STAY**

Action Filed: May 1, 2020

1 The State Intervenor-Defendants oppose the Agencies’ motion to continue the stay of these
2 proceedings, *see* ECF No. 237, for substantially the same reasons that warranted denying the stay
3 in the first place, *see* ECF No. 223. Speculation about future rulemaking ordinarily does not
4 justify staying a legal challenge to a currently effective rule. *See, e.g., Arizona Yage Assembly v.*
5 *Barr*, No. 3:20-CV-03098-WHO, 2020 WL 5629833, at *8 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 21, 2020) (refusing
6 to grant a stay even after new rulemaking began because “it is impossible to predict when the
7 regulations will be finalized”); *California v. U.S. EPA*, 360 F. Supp. 3d 984, 993 (N.D. Cal. 2018)
8 (denying a stay despite the EPA actively preparing a new rule because of “the ordinary
9 uncertainty in the rulemaking process, which creates at least a ‘fair possibility’ of harm”). Much
10 less is a stay justified based on a hypothetical future rulemaking process that the Agencies
11 themselves acknowledge may never occur. ECF No. 237, at 4 (explaining that the
12 Administrator’s review could result in the NWPR being “maintained”).

13 The Agencies now assert that continuing that stay will “allow time for the new
14 Administrator to consider options and make an informed decision regarding which direction it
15 will take with respect to the Rule.” *Id.* at 3–4. But that review can occur at any time, with or
16 without a stay. *Id.* at 4 (explaining that “Agencies have inherent authority to review past
17 decisions and to revise, replace, or repeal a decision” (citing *FCC v. Fox Television Stations, Inc.*,
18 556 U.S. 502, 515 (2009))). The Agencies do not explain how continuing the stay in this
19 litigation would actually aid or allow for this ongoing review of apparently indefinite duration.
20 On the other hand, resolving this lawsuit on the merits would provide clarity on the legal bounds
21 of the Agencies’ authority, *see* ECF No. 223, at 4, which *would* undoubtedly aid the Agencies in
22 their consideration of any future rulemaking. Because the Agencies have not made anything
23 approaching a “clear case of hardship or inequity in being required to go forward,” *California v.*
24 *EPA*, 360 F. Supp. 3d at 993 (quoting *Landis v. North American Co.*, 299 U.S. 248, 255 (1936)),
25 and continuing the stay indefinitely will further prolong the legal uncertainty about the scope of
26 the Agencies’ jurisdiction, this Court should deny their motion to continue the stay.

1 Respectfully submitted.

2 /s/ Bradley A. Benbrook
3 Bradley A. Benbrook
4 Benbrook Law Group
5 400 Capitol Mall, Ste 2530
6 Sacramento, CA 95814
7 Tel: (916) 447-4900
8 Fax: (916) 447-4904
9 Email: ben@benbrooklawgroup.com
10 *Counsel for Intervening States*

11 PATRICK MORRISEY
12 *West Virginia Attorney General*

13 /s/ Lindsay S. See
14 Lindsay S. See
15 *Solicitor General*
16 Thomas T. Lampman
17 *Assistant Solicitor General*
18 West Virginia Office of the Attorney General
19 1900 Kanawha Blvd. East
20 Building 1, Room E-26
21 Tel: (304) 558-2021
22 Fax: (304) 558-0140
23 Email: lindsay.s.see@wvago.gov
24 *Counsel for Intervenor State of West Virginia*

25 TREG R. TAYLOR
26 *Attorney General of Alaska*

27 /s/ Jennifer Currie
28 Jennifer Currie
Senior Assistant Attorney General
Alaska Department of Law
1031 West 4th Avenue, Suite 200
Anchorage, AK 99501-1994
Tel: (907) 269-5100
Fax: (907) 276-3697
Email: attorney.general@alaska.gov
Counsel for Intervenor State of Alaska

LAWRENCE WASDEN
Attorney General of Idaho

/s/ Mark Cecchini-Beaver
Mark Cecchini-Beaver
Deputy Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
Environmental Quality Section
1410 N. Hilton, 2nd Floor
Boise, ID 83706
Tel: (208) 373-0494

CHRISTOPHER M. CARR
Attorney General of Georgia

/s/ Andrew A. Pinson
Andrew A. Pinson
Solicitor General
Drew F. Waldbeser
Assistant Solicitor General
Office of the Attorney General
40 Capitol Square, S.W.
Atlanta, Georgia 30334
Tel: (404) 651-9453
Fax: (404) 656-2199
Email: apinson@law.ga.gov
Counsel for Intervenor State of Georgia

STEVE MARSHALL
Attorney General of Alabama

/s/ A Barrett Bowdre
A. Barrett Bowdre*
Deputy Solicitor General
Office of the Attorney General
501 Washington Ave.
P.O. Box 300152
Montgomery, AL 36130
Telephone: (334) 353-8892
Fax: (334) 353-8400
Email: barrett.bowdre@AlabamaAG.gov
Counsel for Intervenor State of Alabama

LESLIE RUTLEDGE
Attorney General of Arkansas
Nicholas J. Bronni
Solicitor General
Vincent M. Wagner
Deputy Solicitor General

/s/ Dylan L. Jacobs
Dylan L. Jacobs
Assistant Solicitor General
Office of the Attorney General
323 Center St., Suite 200
Little Rock, AR 72201
Tel: (501) 682-3661
Fax: (501) 682-2591
Email: Dylan.Jacobs@ArkansasAG.gov
Counsel for Intervenor State of Arkansas

THEODORE E. ROKITA
Attorney General of Indiana

1 Fax: (208) 373-0481
2 Email: Mark.Cecchini-Beaver@deq.idaho.gov
3 *Counsel for Intervenor State of Idaho*

4 DEREK SCHMIDT
5 *Attorney General of Kansas*

6 /s/ Jeffrey A. Chanay
7 Jeffrey A. Chanay
8 *Chief Deputy Attorney General*

9 Office of the Attorney General
10 120 SW 10th Ave., 3rd Floor
11 Topeka, Kansas 66612
12 Tel: (785) 368-8435
13 Email: jeff.chanay@ag.ks.gov
14 *Counsel for Intervenor State of Kansas*

15 JEFF LANDRY
16 *Attorney General of Louisiana*

17 /s/ Elizabeth B. Murrill
18 Elizabeth B. Murrill
19 *Solicitor General*
20 Joseph Scott St. John
21 *Deputy Attorney General*
22 Louisiana Department of Justice
23 1885 N. 3rd St.
24 Baton Rouge, LA 70802
25 Tel: (225) 456-7544
26 Email: MurrillE@ag.louisiana.gov
27 *Counsel for Intervenor State of Louisiana*

28 ERIC S. SCHMITT
29 *Attorney General of Missouri*

30 /s/ Julie Marie Blake
31 Julie Marie Blake
32 *Deputy Solicitor General*
33 Office of the Attorney General
34 P.O. Box 899
35 Jefferson City, MO 65102
36 Tel: (573) 751-3321
37 Fax: (573) 751-0774
38 Email: Julie.Blake@ago.mo.gov
39 *Counsel for Intervenor State of Missouri*

40 DOUGLAS J. PETERSON
41 *Attorney General*

42 /s/ James A. Campbell
43 James A. Campbell
44 *Solicitor General*

/s/ Thomas M. Fisher
Thomas M. Fisher
Solicitor General of Indiana
Office of the Indiana Attorney General
302 W. Washington Street, IGCS, 5th Floor
Indianapolis, Indiana
Tel: (317) 233-8292
Fax: (317) 233-8292
Email: tom.fisher@atg.in.gov
Counsel for Intervenor State of Indiana

DANIEL CAMERON
Attorney General of Kentucky

/s/ Carmine G. Iaccarino
Carmine G. Iaccarino
Executive Director, Office of Civil & Environmental Law
Office of the Attorney General
700 Capitol Avenue
Frankfort, Kentucky 40601
Tel: (502) 696-5650
Email: Carmine.Iaccarino@ky.gov
Counsel for Intervenor Commonwealth of Kentucky

LYNN FITCH
Attorney General of Mississippi

/s/ Scott Stewart
Scott Stewart
Solicitor General
Office of the Attorney General
P.O. Box 220
Jackson, Mississippi 39205
Tel: (601) 359-5563
Email: Scott.Stewart@ago.ms.gov
Counsel for Intervenor State of Mississippi
Application for Admission Pro Hac Vice Forthcoming

AUSTIN KNUDSEN
Attorney General of Montana

/s/David M.S. Dewhirst
David M.S. Dewhirst
Solicitor General
Office of the Attorney General
215 North Sanders / P.O. Box 201401
Helena, MT 59620-1401
Tel: (406) 444-3602
Email: david.dewhirst@mt.gov

1 Justin D. Lavene
Assistant Attorney General
2 Office of the Nebraska Attorney General
2115 State Capitol
3 Lincoln, NE 68509
Email: justin.lavene@nebraska.gov
4 Email: jim.campbell@nebraska.gov
Tel: (402) 471-2682
5 *Counsel for Intervenor State of Nebraska*

6 DAVE YOST
Attorney General of Ohio

7 /s/ Benjamin M. Flowers
8 Benjamin M. Flowers
Solicitor General
9 Office of Ohio Attorney General
30 E. Broad St., 17th Floor
10 Columbus, OH 43215
Tel: (614) 728-7511
11 Email: bflowers@ohioattorneygeneral.gov
Counsel for Intervenor State of Ohio

13 ALAN WILSON
Attorney General

14 /s/ James Emory Smith, Jr.
15 James Emory Smith, Jr.
Deputy Solicitor General
16 Office of the Attorney General
1000 Assembly Street, Room 519
17 Columbia, South Carolina 29201
Tel: (803) 734-3680
18 Email: esmith@scag.gov
Counsel for Intervenor State of South Carolina

20 HERBERT H. SLATERY, III
Attorney General and Reporter of Tennessee
21 Andrée S. Blumstein
Solicitor General
22 Sarah K. Campbell
Associate Solicitor General

23 /s/ Elizabeth P. McCarter
24 Elizabeth P. McCarter
Senior Assistant Attorney General
25 Office of the Attorney General
P.O. Box 20207
26 Nashville, TN 37202
Tel: (615) 532-2582
27 Email: lisa.mccarter@ag.tn.gov
28

Counsel for Intervenor State of Montana

WAYNE STENEHJEM
Attorney General of North Dakota

/s/ Margaret I. Olson
Margaret I. Olson
Assistant Attorney General
North Dakota Office of Attorney General
500 N. 9th Street
Bismarck, ND 58501
Tel: (701) 328-3640
Fax: (701) 328-4300
Email: maiolson@nd.gov
Counsel for Intervenor State of North Dakota

MIKE HUNTER
Attorney General of Oklahoma

/s/ Mithun Mansinghani
Mithun Mansinghani
Solicitor General
Oklahoma Office of the Attorney General
313 NE 21st Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73105
Tel: (405) 522-4392
Email: Mithun.Mansinghani@aog.ok.gov
Counsel for Intervenor State of Oklahoma

JASON R. RAVNSBORG
Attorney General

/s/ Ann F. Mines Bailey
Ann F. Mines Bailey
Assistant Attorney General
State of South Dakota
1302 E. Highway 14, Suite 1
Pierre, SD 57501-8501
Tel: (605) 773-3215
Fax: (605) 773-4106
Email: ann.mines@state.sd.us
Counsel for Intervenor State of South Dakota

KEN PAXTON
Attorney General of Texas

/s/ Judd E. Stone II
Judd E. Stone II
Solicitor General
Office of the Attorney General
P.O. Box 12548
Austin, TX 78711-2548

1 *Counsel for Intervenor State of Tennessee*

Tel: (512) 936-1700

Fax: (512) 474-2697

Email: Kyle.Hawkins@oag.texas.gov

Counsel for Intervenor State of Texas

2 SEAN D. REYES

3 *Attorney General of Utah*

4 /s/ Daniel Burton

Daniel Burton

Chief Policy Counsel

5 Office of the Attorney General

6 Utah State Capitol Complex

350 North State Street, Suite 230

7 Salt Lake City, Utah 84114-2320

8 Tel: (801) 538-9600

Email: danburton@agutah.gov

9 *Counsel for Intervenor State of Utah*

BRIDGET HILL

Attorney General of Wyoming

10 /s/ James C. Kaste

James C. Kaste

Deputy Attorney General

11 Office of the Attorney General

2320 Capitol Avenue

12 Cheyenne, WY 82002

13 Tel: (307) 777-6946

14 Fax: (307) 777-3542

15 Email: james.kaste@wyo.gov

16 *Counsel for Intervenor State of Wyoming*

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on April 15, 2021, I served this opposition to plaintiffs’ motion for a preliminary injunction and cross-motion for summary judgment by filing it with this Court’s ECF system.

/s/ Andrew A. Pinson
Andrew A. Pinson

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28